95798 - Raising the hands in the first tashahhud – before or after standing?

the question

Raising the hands in the first tashahhud – should it be whilst one is sitting before standing up, or when standing up after the tashahhud?.

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

Firstly:

It is proven in the saheeh Sunnah of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) that the hands should be raised when saying takbeer in four places: the opening takbeer (takbeerat al-ihraam), before bowing, after rising from bowing, and after standing up following the middle tashahhud in a three- or four-rak'ah prayer. This is different from the view of the Hanafis, who say that the hands should be raised only with the opening takbeer, and unlike the majority of Hanbalis who say that the hands should not be raised in the fourth place.

See the answers to questions no. 3267 and 21439.

Secondly:

With regard to raising the hands after the middle tashahhud and standing up for the third rak'ah, the scholars differed as to the point at which the hands should be raised. Some of them said: before standing up, when one is still sitting. This is the view of the Shaafa'is and of the scholars of the Standing Committee, and of Shaykh al-Albani. Others said that it is after standing up. This is the view of Abu Hurayrah, Ibn 'Umar, Imam Maalik and others; it was also stated by Shaykh al-'Uthaymeen in his fatwas.

There are proven ahaadeeth about this raising of the hands, including the following:

1-

It was narrated from Naafi' that when Ibn 'Umar began to pray he would say takbeer and raise his hands, and when he bowed he would raise his hands, and when he said 'Sami'a Allahu liman hamidah (Allah hears the one who praises him)' he would raise his hands, and when he stood up after two rak'ahs he would raise his hands.

And Ibn 'Umar attributed that to the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him).

This was narrated by al-Bukhari, who included it in a chapter entitled: "Chapter on raising the hands when standing up after two rak'ahs".

We shall see clearly below that Ibn 'Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) would say takbeer and raise his hands after he had stood up straight.

2-

It was narrated from Abu Hurayrah that he would say takbeer in every prayer, obligatory or otherwise, in Ramadaan and at other times. He would say takbeer when he stood up, then he would say takbeer when he bowed, then he would say 'Sami'a Allahu lima hamidah (Allah hears the one who praises him)', then he would say, 'Rabbana wa laka'l-hamd (Our Lord, to You be praise)' before he prostrated; then he would say Allahu akbar when he went down in prostration, then he would say takbeer when he raised his head from prostration, then he would say takbeer when he prostrated, then he would say takbeer when he lifted his head from prostration, then he would say takbeer when he stood up after sitting following the two rak'ahs, and he would do that in every rak'ah until he had finished the prayer. Then he would say when he finished: By the One in Whose hand is my soul, I am the one among you whose prayer most closely resembles that of the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him). That is how he used to pray until he departed this world.

Narrated by al-Bukhari (770) and Muslim (392).

We shall see below that Abu Hurayrah (may Allah be pleased with him) would say takbeer after he had stood up straight.

3-

It was narrated from ‘Ali ibn Abi Taalib (may Allah be pleased with him) that when the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) stood up to offer an obligatory prayer, he would say takbeer and raise his hands up to his shoulders, and he would do that when he had finished his recitation and wanted to bow, and he would do it when he rose from bowing, but he did not raise his hands at any point during his prayer when he was sitting, but when he stood up after two prostrations he would raise his hands likewise and say takbeer.

Narrated by al-Tirmidhi (3423); he said it is hasan saheeh. Also narrated by Abu Dawood (744) and classed as saheeh by Ibn Khuzaymah (584), Ibn Taymiyah in al-Fataawa (22/453) and al-Albani in Saheeh al-Tirmidhi.

What is meant by the phrase “when he stood up after two prostrations” is when he stood up after two rak’ahs. This is stated clearly in one of the two reports of al-Bukhari in the section on “Raising the hands” where it says: When he stood up after two rak’ahs he would do likewise.

4-

It was narrated from Muhammad ibn ‘Amr ibn ‘Ata’ that Abu Humayd al-Saa’idi said: I heard him when he was among ten of the companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him), one of whom was Abu Qataadah ibn Rib’i, saying, I am the most knowledgeable of you about the prayer of the Messenger of Allah (S). They said: You are not among the senior of us in terms of companionship and you are not among those who met him often. He said: Yes I was. They said: Then tell us. He said: When the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) stood up to pray, he stood up straight and raised his hands until they were in line with his shoulders. When he wanted to bow in rukoo’, he raised his hands until they were in line with his shoulders, then he said “Allahu akbar” and bowed, and he made his backbone straight, neither raising his head nor lowering it, and he put his hands on his knees.

Then he said “Sami’a Allahu liman hamidah (Allah hears those who praise Him),” and raised his hands and stood up straight until every bone went back to its place. Then he went down in prostration, then he said “Allahu akbar” and held his upper arms away from his body and spread out his toes. Then he would tuck his foot under his body and sit on it. Then he sat upright until every bone has returned to its place. Then he went down in prostration. Then he said Allahu akbar and tucked his foot under his body and sat on it. Then he sat upright until every bone has returned to its place. Then he got up, then he did likewise in the second rak’ah , and when he stood up after two rak’ahs, he said takbeer and raised his hands until they were in line with his shoulders, as he did when he started the prayer, then he did likewise until, in the rak’ah with which he ended his prayer, he pushed back his right foot and sat on his left buttock mutawarrikan (with the left upper thigh on the ground and both feet protruding from one (i.e., the right) side), then he said the salaam.

Narrated by al-Tirmidhi (304), Abu Dawood (730), al-Nasaa’i (1181) and Ibn Majaah (862). Classed as saheeh by al-Tirmidhi, al-Nawawi in al-Majmoo’ (3/447) and al-Albani in Saheeh al-Tirmidhi.

Ibn al-Qayyim (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

This hadeeth of Abu Humayd is a saheeh hadeeth that accepted (by the scholars) and has no faults. Some people regarded it as having faults but Allah and the scholars of hadeeth showed it to be free of such faults. We will mention the faults they ascribed to it, then we will explain what is wrong with their thinking …

Haashiyat Ibn al-Qayyim ‘ala Tahdheeb Sunan Abi Dawood (2/295).

Al-Nawawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

What is meant by the two prostrations is undoubtedly two rak’ahs, as it says in the reports of the others. This was stated by the scholars, both muhadditheen and fuqaha’, except for al-Khattaabi, who thought that what was meant was the two well known prostrations, then he was confused about the hadeeth and said: I do not know of any of the fuqaha’ who said that. It is as if he did not study its isnaads; if he had studied them, he would have understood it as referring to two rak’ahs

as the imams did.

Al-Majmoo’ (3/447).

Thirdly:

The opinions of the scholars, and the reason for the difference of opinion:

1-

The first opinion:

Those scholars who said that the worshipper should raise his hands whilst he is still sitting, before he stands up for the third rak’ah, only said that because of the apparent meaning of some of the texts that we have quoted, which say that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) raised his hands before standing. What is meant by “when he stood up” in their view is when he wanted to stand up.

Because of that, raising the hands was mentioned in conjunction with the takbeer. There are texts which clearly state that that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) said the takbeer for the third rak’ah when he was still sitting, so these scholars said that the takbeer should be accompanied by the raising of the hands.

Abu Ya’la (10/419) narrated that Abu Hurayrah (may Allah be pleased with him) said: When the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) wanted to prostrate he would say takbeer then prostrate, and when he stood up after sitting he said takbeer then stand up.

Shaykh al-Albani (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

This hadeeth clearly shows that the Sunnah is to say takbeer and then prostrate, and to say takbeer whilst sitting, then get up.

Al-Silsilah al-Saheehah (2/157), hadeeth no. 604.

It should be noted that some of those who study hadeeth refuted the Shaykh (may Allah have mercy on him) and explained that this report of Abu Ya'la is shaadhdh (odd). We say: Even if it is saheeh, it does not mention raising the hands.

Those imams did not think that the words of the narrator "when he stood up he said takbeer" mean that he said takbeer after standing; rather it was when he wanted to stand up. This is like the verse in which Allah says (interpretation of the meaning): "So when you want to recite the Qur'aan, seek refuge with Allah from Shaytaan (Satan), the outcast (the cursed one)" [al-Nahl 16:98]; the original text literally says "when you recite" but what is meant is: when you want to recite, then seek refuge with Allah.

Imam Ibn Khuzaymah (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) would raise his hands when he said takbeer to pray, and when he bowed, and when he raised his head from bowing. This indicates that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) enjoined raising the hands when the worshipper wants to bow, and when he raises his head from bowing. Every phrase that has been narrated concerning this shows that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) raised his hands when he bowed. This is like the verse in which Allah says (interpretation of the meaning): "O you who believe! When you intend [lit. get up] to offer As-Salaah (the prayer), wash your faces …" [al-Maa'idah 5:6]. Allah enjoined washing the parts of the body that are washed in wudoo' when a person intends to pray, not after he starts to do it. What is meant by the phrase "When you intend [lit. get up] to offer As-Salaah" is when you intend to do it. The same is meant by the phrase "he would raise his hands when he bowed" i.e., when he wanted to bow, as in the report of 'Ali ibn Abi Taalib and Ibn 'Umar, who said: "When he wanted to bow."

Saheeh Ibn Khuzaymah (1/296).

The scholars of the Standing Committee were asked:

What is the ruling on raising the hands after standing up for the third rak'ah, i.e., when one has finished the first two rak'ahs then gets up to do the third rak'ah – is it permissible to raise your

hands when standing or not? Please quote the evidence.

They replied:

It is Sunnah to raise the hands when getting up for the third rak'ah in a three- or four-rak'ah prayer, after reciting the tashahhud in the second rak'ah, because of the report narrated by al-Bukhari and others, that when Ibn 'Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) started to pray he would say takbeer and raise his hands, and when he bowed he would raise his hands, and when he said 'Sami'a Allahu liman hamidah (Allah hears the one who praises Him) he would raise his hands, and when he stood up after the two rak'ahs he would raise his hands, and Ibn 'Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) attributed that to the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him).

Shaykh 'Abd al-'Azeez ibn Baaz, Shaykh 'Abd al-Razzaaq 'Afeefi, Shaykh 'Abd-Allah ibn Ghadyaan, Shaykh 'Abd-Allah ibn Qa'ood.

Fataawa al-Lajnah al-Daa'imah (6/346).

They were also asked:

How should the takbeer when standing up after the first tashahhud and raising the hands be done? Should (the worshipper) raise his hands when he is still sitting, then say takbeer and get up? Or should he not raise his hands until after he has stood up? Which is the more correct view?

They replied:

It is prescribed to raise the hands in prayer when getting up after the first tashahhud, and say takbeer after one has started to move from sitting to standing.

Shaykh 'Abd al-'Azeez ibn Baaz, Shaykh 'Abd al-Razzaaq 'Afeefi, Shaykh 'Abd-Allah ibn Ghadyaan

Fataawa al-Lajnah al-Daa'imah (6/347).

2-

The second opinion:

The scholars said that the hands should be raised after standing up, and that it is not necessary to raise the hands at the same time as saying takbeer; the takbeer may come before raising the hands, or raising the hands may come before the takbeer, or they may be done at the same time. All of these are proven in the Sunnah about the places where one is to say takbeer and raise the hands. Some of these imams do not think one should say takbeer when sitting, even if it is without raising the hands, rather they think it should be said when standing. They said: The text should be understood in accordance with its apparent meaning, and the texts prove that he used to raise his hands "when he stood up" which means when he had finished standing.

Shaykh Muhammad ibn Saalih al-'Uthaymeen (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

Based on this, the places where the hands are to be raised are four:

When saying the opening takbeer, when bowing, when rising from bowing, and when standing up after the first tashahhud, which should be done after one has stood up, because the wording of the hadeeth of Ibn 'Umar is: "When he stood up after two rak'ahs, he raised his hands," and that can only mean when he had finished standing. Based on this, (the worshipper) should not raise his hands when he is sitting and then get up, as some people imagine. It is known that the phrase "when he stood up" does not mean when he was getting up, rather there is a difference between the two.

There is no raising of the hands apart from that.

Al-Sharh al-Mumti' (3/214).

This is with regard to raising the hands. As for saying takbeer, the Shaykh – may Allah have mercy on him – said that it should come between the two positions, not with either one of them. With regard to the issue under discussion here, he should say takbeer whilst moving to stand up, and raise his hands when he had stood up fully.

Shaykh al-'Uthaymeen (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

The takbeer for moving from one posture of the prayer to another should be said between the two posture. So when he wants to prostrate, he should say takbeer between standing and prostrating, and when he wants to stand up after prostrating, he should say takbeer between prostrating and standing. This is what is best.

If he starts to say takbeer before he goes down to prostrate, and completes it as he is going down, there is nothing wrong with that. Similarly if he starts it whilst he is going down and does not complete it until he is prostrating, there is nothing wrong with it.

Majmoo' Fataawa al-Shaykh al-'Uthaymeen (13/question no. 511).

What makes it more likely that this view is correct is what it says in the third hadeeth – the hadeeth of 'Ali (may Allah be pleased with him) – in which he says "he did not raise his hands at any point during his prayer when he was sitting".

It seems that this view is the one that was regarded as more correct by Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah.

He (may Allah have mercy on him) was asked about raising the hands after standing up following the sitting after the first two rak'ahs: is it recommended? Did the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) or any of the Sahaabah do it?

He replied: Yes, it is recommended according to the scholars who are well versed in the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him), and it is one of the two views narrated from Ahmad, and the view of a number of his companions, and the companions of al-Shaafa'i, and others. That was proven from the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) in the books of al-Saheeh and al-Sunan.

Majmoo' al-Fataawa (22/452).

Imam Maalik (may Allah have mercy on him) was of the view that the worshipper should not say takbeer when standing up for the third rak'ah until after he has stood up straight. He narrated that in al-Muwatta' from some of the Sahaabah.

Al-Haafiz Ibn Hajar (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

He differed from Maalik with regard to standing up for the third rak'ah following the first tashahhud. He narrated in al-Muwatta' from Abu Hurayrah, Ibn 'Umar and others that they used to say takbeer as they were standing up, and Ibn Wahb narrated from him that saying takbeer after standing up straight is better. In al-Mudawwanah it says that one should not say takbeer until one is standing up straight.

Fath al-Baari (2/304).

Ibn Daqeeq al-Eid (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

They differed concerning the time of this takbeer. Some of them favoured the view that it should be when starting to get up, which is the view of al-Shaafa'i. Others were of the view that it should be when one has stood up straight. This is the view of Maalik.

Ahkaam al-Ihkaam (p. 244).

The action of Abu Hurayrah:

'Abd al-Razzaaq narrated that Ibn Jurayj said: 'Ata' told me: I prayed behind Abu Hurayrah and I heard him saying takbeer when he started to pray, and when he bowed, and when he went down to prostrate, then when he raised his head, then when he lowered his head for the second prostration, then when he raised his head, then when he stood up straight after two (rak'ahs).

He said to me: That is how the takbeer should be in every prayer.

Musannaf 'Abd al-Razzaaq (2492). Its isnaad is saheeh.

The action of 'Abd-Allah ibn 'Umar:

'Abd al-Razzaaq narrated that Ibn Jurayj said: Naafi' told me that Ibn 'Umar used to say takbeer with his hands when he started to pray, and when he bowed, and when he said 'Sami'a Allahu liman hamidah (Allah hears the one who praises Him) and when he raised his head from bowing,

and when he stood up straight after two (rak'ahs). He said: And he did not say takbeer with his hands when he raised his head after the two prostrations.

Narrated by 'Abd al-Razzaaq in al-Musannaf (2520) and by al-Bukhari in Juz' Rafa' al-Yadayn (38). Its isnaad is saheeh.

If these Sahaabah – along with Imam Maalik – say that the takbeer should come when one has stood up straight, then it is more likely that the hands should be raised when standing. The report of Ibn 'Umar clearly shows that he said takbeer and raised his hands when he had stood up straight.

But we do not accept that it is not allowed to say takbeer when sitting, before standing up, or whilst getting up – as Imam Maalik disallowed it – because there is evidence which indicates that one may say takbeer whilst sitting and we cannot reject that. This is the view of the majority of scholars. But as for raising the hands, we think that it should be done whilst standing.

Al-Bukhari said, in a chapter entitled: Saying takbeer whilst getting up after doing two rak'ahs and Ibn al-Zubayr used to say takbeer whilst getting up. He narrated two hadeeth concerning that.

1-

It was narrated that Sa'eed ibn al-Haarith said: Abu Sa'eed led us in prayer and he said the takbeer out loud when he raised his head from prostration, and when he prostrated, and when he stood up following the two rak'ahs. He said: This is what I saw the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) do.

2-

It was narrated that Mutarrif said: 'Imraan ibn Husayn and I prayed behind 'Ali ibn Abi Taalib (may Allah be pleased with him). When he prostrated he said takbeer, and when he raised his head he said takbeer, and when he got up after two rak'ahs he said takbeer. When he said the salaam, 'Imraan took me by the hand and said: This man has led us in a prayer like that of Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him), or: This man reminded me of the prayer of

Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him).

Narrated by al-Bukhari (753) and Muslim (393).

Ibn Rajab (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

The evidence in these two ahaadeeth which al-Bukhari quoted in this chapter shows that in the hadeeth of Abu Sa'eed the takbeer comes when rising from prostration, which is apparent in starting to say takbeer when starting to rise.

As for the hadeeth of 'Imraan, it says: "When he rose, he said takbeer" which may also be understood as meaning that he said takbeer when he started to rise.

The hadeeth of Abu Hurayrah to which we referred is clearer than all of that; it says: "He used to say takbeer when he raised his head from the first and second prostration." There is no dispute concerning this.

In the hadeeth of Abu Sa'eed the takbeer comes "When he stood up following the two rak'ahs." In the hadeeth of 'Imraan is says: "When he got up following the two rak'ahs he said takbeer."

There was a difference of opinion concerning the interpretation of this. The majority interpreted it as meaning that he said takbeer when he began to stand up and get up.

In the hadeeth of Abu Hurayrah referred to at the beginning of the chapter, it says: "He said takbeer when he stood up from sitting in the two (rak'ahs)."

This is the view of Abu Haneefah, al-Thawri, al-Shaafa'i and Ahmad.

Maalik said – according to the better known of the two reports narrated from him: He should not say takbeer when he stands up after the two rak'ahs until he is standing up straight, because in some versions of the hadeeth of Abu Humayd and his companions it says: "when he stood up following the two rak'ahs he said takbeer."

This was narrated by al-Tirmidhi, al-Nasaa'i, Ibn Majaah and Ibn Hibbaan.

A similar report was narrated from Abu Hurayrah, Anas and others.

These ahaadeeth may be understood as meaning that he said takbeer when he wanted to stand up following the first tashahhud.

Fath al-Baari by al-Haafiz Ibn Rajab (6/64).

Al-Haafiz Ibn Hajar (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

His saying: “Chapter: he should say takbeer as he is getting up after the two prostrations” – the majority of scholars are of the view that the worshipper should start to say takbeer and so on when he starts to go down or get up, but there was a difference of opinion from Maalik with regard to standing up for this third rak’ah after the first tashahhud.

Fath al-Baari (2/304).

To sum up:

1. It is proven that one should say takbeer when moving up or down in all movements of the prayer.

2. It is proven that the hands should be raised in four places: when saying the opening takbeer, when bowing, when rising from bowing, and when standing up for the third rak’ah.

3. The Hanafis say that the hands should only be raised for the opening takbeer, and the Hanbalis say that the hands should be raised in the first three places but not the fourth.

4. The majority of scholars say that the takbeer for standing up for the third rak’ah should be said whilst sitting before standing up, or when getting up, unlike Imam Maalik who said that the takbeer should come after one has stood up straight. From all the reports that we have quoted in this answer, it is clear to us that the takbeer may come before standing up, whilst standing up and after standing up.

5. What is proven from the apparent meaning of many of the ahaadeeth, and from the actions

of some of the Sahaabah, is that the raising the hands in these places comes after one has finished standing up, especially as it says that there is no raising the hands when sitting, as we quoted in the third hadeeth, from ‘Ali (may Allah be pleased with him), which says: “he did not raise his hands at any point during his prayer when he was sitting”. Even though that may be interpreted as referring to not raising the hands when prostrating and when rising from prostration.

6. This issue is one of the issues in which different views are acceptable, and it is Sunnah, not an obligatory part of prayer, so it is not permissible to denounce harshly the one who does something different, let alone hate him or cut off ties with him.

Note:

If a person joins the prayer late and has missed a rak’ah – for example – there is a difference concerning the ruling. Should he raise his hands after reciting the first tashahhud – which is the first rak’ah for him – or after the third rak’ah of the imam, which is the second for him? Al-Haafiz Ibn Rajab al-Hanbali regarded it is more likely that raising the hands is connected to the tashahhud not to it being the third rak’ah, and this is an acceptable argument. Some of the scholars regarded that as more likely for a different reason, which is following the imam, if the imam raises his hands at this point.

Mardaawi al-Hanbali (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

As for raising the hands when standing up following the first tashahhud – if we regard it as mustahabb – it may be understood that he should raise them when he stands up for the rak’ah that is judged to be the third, whether he stands up following the tashahhud or otherwise, and it may be understood that he should raise his hands when he stands up following his first tashahhud, whether that is immediately after the second rak’ah or not. He said: This is more likely to be correct."(Al-Insaaf 2/227).

And Allah knows best.