

116338 - Ahaadeeth which contain a warning to the one who does not accept the apology of his Muslim brother

the question

How sound is this hadeeth: “Whoever is given an apology by his Muslim brother and does not accept his apology will have a punishment like that of the maks collector [a kind of tax or levy]”?

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

There are five hadeeths which speak of the severity of the sin of one who does not accept the apology of his Muslim brother, but they are all weak and are not sound.

1.

The first hadeeth was narrated from Joodaan he said: The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “If a man makes an excuse to his brother and he does not accept it, he will bear a burden of sin like that of the maks collector [a kind of tax of levy].”

Narrated by Abu Dawood in al-Maraaseel, no. 521; Ibn Maajah in al-Sunan, no. 3718; Ibn Hibbaan in Rawdat al-'Uqala', p. 182; al-Tabaraani in al-Mu'jam al-Kabeer, 2/275; al-Bayhaqi in Shu'ab al-Eemaan, 6/321 and others. They all narrated it via Wakee', Sufyaan told us, from Ibn Jurayj, from Ibn Meena' – who is al-'Abbaas ibn 'Abd al-Rahmaan ibn Meena' – from Joodaan.

Shaykh al-Albaani said in al-Silsilah al-Da'eefah (no. 1907): al-'Abbaas ibn 'Abd al-Rahmaan ibn Meena' is not well known and was not regarded as trustworthy by anyone except Ibn Hibbaan. Hence al-Haafiz said in al-Taqreeb: He is maqbool (acceptable).

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

Joodaan: there is no proof that he was a Companion of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him). Abu Haatim said: Joodaan is majhool (unknown) and he was not a Companion of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him).

In al-Taqreeb it says: There is a difference of opinion as to whether he was a companion of the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him). Ibn Hibbaan mentioned him among the trustworthy of the Taabi'een. End quote.

2.

The second hadeeth was narrated from Jaabir ibn 'Abd-Allaah (may Allah be pleased with him) and is similar to the previous hadeeth.

It was narrated by Abu'l-Zubayr from Jaabir (may Allah be pleased with him), and it was narrated from Abu'l-Zubayr via two isnaads:

(i) Via al-Layth, Ibraaheem ibn A'yan told me, from Abu 'Amr al-'Abdi, from Abu'l-Zubayr, from Jaabir ibn 'Abd-Allaah (may Allah be pleased with him) from the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him).

This was narrated by al-Tabaraani in al-Mu'jam al-Awsat, 8/283 and al-Bayhaqi in Shu'ab al-Eemaan, 6/321. al-Tabaraani said: This hadeeth was not narrated from Abu'l-Zubayr except by Abu 'Amr al-'Abdi, nor from Abu 'Amr except by Ibraaheem ibn A'yun, and al-Layth was the only one who narrated it. End quote.

Al-Haythami said in Majma' al-Zawaa'id (8/155): Its isnaad includes Ibraaheem ibn A'yun who is da'eef (weak). End quote.

It was also classed as da'eef by al-Iraqi (may Allah have mercy on him) in Takhreej Ahaadeeth al-Ihya', 2/138

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

(ii) Via al-Hasan ibn 'Amaarah from Abu'l-Zubayr from Jaabir (may Allah be pleased with him)

It was narrated by al-Haarith in al-Musnad – as stated in Baghiyat al-Baahith 'an Zawaa'id Musnad al-Haarith (1/269) that he said:

Hafs ibn Hamzah told us, Sayf ibn Muhammad al-Thawri told us, from al-Hasan ibn 'Amaarah.

It was also narrated by Ibn Hibbaan in al-Thiqaat (8/388): Abu Badr told us, my paternal uncle al-Waleed ibn 'Abd al-Malik ibn 'Ubayd-Allah ibn Masrah told us, Ubayy told us from al-Hasan ibn 'Amaarah from Abu'l-Zubayr, from Jaabir (may Allah be pleased with him).

This is a very weak isnaad, because of al-Hasan ibn 'Amaarah. The scholars were unanimously agreed that he is to be rejected and he is weak. See Tahdheeb al-Tahdheeb, 2/307.

3.

The third hadeeth was narrated from 'Aa'ishah (may Allah be pleased with her) from the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) who said: "Be chaste and your women will be chaste; honour your parents and your children will honour you; and if someone apologises to his Muslim brother for something he heard about him and he does not accept his apology, he will not come to me at the Cistern."

Narrated by al-Tabaraani in al-Mu'jam al-Awsat, 6/241. He said: This hadeeth was not narrated from 'Aamir ibn 'Abd-Allaah ibn al-Zubayr except by al-Malik ibn Yahya ibn al-Zubayr, and it was narrated only by Khaalid ibn Yazeed al-'Umari. End quote.

Al-Haythami said in Majma' al-Zawaa'id (8/81): Its isnaad includes Khaalid ibn Zayd al-'Umari who is a liar. End quote.

4.

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

The fourth hadeeth was narrated from Anas ibn Maalik and is similar to the hadeeth of 'Aa'ishah quoted above.

It was narrated by Ibn 'Asaakir in his Sabaa'iyat – as stated by al-Suyooti in al-La'aali' al-Masnoo'ah (2/190) – via Abu Hadabah al-Faarisi, from Anas ibn Maalik.

Abu Hadabah al-Faarisi is Ibraaheem ibn Hadabah, who is a liar. Ibn Hibbaan said in al-Majrooheen (1/114): Ibraaheem ibn Hadabah, Abu Hadabah, an old man who narrated from Anas ibn Maalik, is one of the charlatans. He was a dancer in Basra who would be invited to weddings and would dance at them. When he grew old he started to narrate fabricated reports from Anas. End quote.

Shaykh al-Albaani said in Da'eef al-Targheeb (2/119): It is mawdoo' (fabricated). End quote.

He said something similar in al-Silsilah al-Da'eefah, no. 2043.

5.

The fifth hadeeth was narrated from Abu Hurayrah (may Allah be pleased with him): The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: "Keep away from the people's womenfolk and your womenfolk will be chaste; honour your parents and your children will honour you; if anyone's brother comes to him offering excused to him, let him accept that from him, whether his excuses are well founded or not, for if he does not do that he will not come to me at the Cistern."

Narrated by al-Haakim in al-Mustadrak, 4/154. he said: This is a hadeeth with a saheeh isnaad, although they [al-Bukhaari and Muslim] did not narrate it. Al-Dhahabi commented: Rather Sa'eed is da'eef (weak). End quote.

Al-Mundhiri said in al-Targheeb wa'l-Tarheeb (3/218): Suwayd from Qutaadah, who is Ibn 'Abd al-'Azeez, is waahin (weak). End quote.

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

Shaykh al-Albaani said in al-Silsilah al-Da'eefah (no. 2034): Its isnaad is da'eef (weak). End quote.

To sum up: all the reports that were narrated concerning this matter are da'eef (weak) and are not saheeh (sound).

Secondly:

The weakness of the hadeeths that give a warning to the one who does not accept his brother's apology does not mean that this is not something that is required. Rather accepting an apology that is given is a noble characteristic and is one of the means of creating love and friendship.

Ibn Hibbaan (may Allah have mercy on him) said in Rawdat al-'Uqala' wa Nuzhat al-Fudala' (1/183): What is required of the wise man if his brother apologises to him for a previous offence or shortcoming is to accept his apology and regard him as being like one who did not commit any error, because if someone offers his excuses to him and he does not accept that, I fear that he will not come to the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) at the Cistern [in the Hereafter].

If a person falls short in his conduct towards his brother, he should apologise for his shortcomings to his brother.

Imam al-Ghazaali (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

If a person commits some shortcomings towards his brother that may lead to friction, there is no scholarly difference of opinion concerning the fact that it is better to overlook it and put up with it; rather if there is a way to interpret it in a good way and forgive him, this is what is required according to the rights of brotherhood.

Ihya' 'Uloom al-Deen, 2/185-186

And Allah knows best.