

151112 - Eating Twice a Day is Extravagance: Unauthentic Hadith

the question

Aishah (may Allah be pleased with her) said: The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) saw that I had eaten twice in one day and he said: "O 'Aishah, do you want to have nothing to worry about except your stomach? Eating twice a day is extravagance and Allah does not love those who are extravagant."

Detailed answer

This hadith was narrated by al-Bayhaqi in Shuʻab al-Eeman (7/441). He said: Abu ʻAbd al-Rahman al-Sulami told us: Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Hamdan narrated to us: Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn ʻUbaydah narrated to us: Yahya ibn ʻUthman al-Masri narrated to us: my father narrated to me: from Ibn Luhayʻah, from Abu'l-Aswad, from ʻUrwah, from ʻAishah (may Allah be pleased with her) – and he quoted it. This isnad (chain of narrators) is daʻeef (weak).

Abu 'Abd al-Rahman al-Sulami's name was Muhammad ibn al-Husayn, the author of the book Tabaqat al-Soofiyyah (d. 412 AH). Al-Hafiz al-Thahabi said concerning him: They criticized him and he is not reliable. See Mizan al-I'tidal, 3/532.

'Abd-Allah ibn Luhay'ah is da'eef (weak) in terms of his memory too.

Hence Imam al-Bayhaqi said, after narrating this report: There is some weakness in it. End quote.

Al-Munthiri (may Allah have mercy on him) said: Its isnad includes Ibn Lunhayʻah. End quote.

Al-Targheeb wa'l-Tarheeb, 3/101

Al-Shaykh al-Albani (may Allah have mercy on hm) said: It is mawdoo' (fabricated). End quote.

Al-Silsilah al-Da'eefah, 257.

Islam Question & Answer Founded And Supervised By: Shaykh Muhammad Saalih Al-Munajjid

We have previously quoted a number of saheeh hadiths (authentic narrations) which condemn extravagance in food. You can see them in the answer to question no. 102374. There is nothing in them to suggest that eating twice in one day is criticized.

To sum up: eating twice in one day is something that is permissible and allowed. It is one of the well-known customs of the Arabs. They used to eat two meals in a day, al-ghada' and al-'asha' (morning and afternoon/evening meals). If a person did not do this, it was only because he was poor; it was not because eating twice in one day is a kind of extravagance.

It was narrated that 'Aishah (may Allah be pleased with her) said: "The family of Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) did not eat two meals in one day but one of them was dates.

Narrated by al-Bukhari, 6455.

Al-Hafiz Ibn Hajar (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

This indicates that sometimes they could not find anything but one meal in a day, and if they did find two meals, one of them would be dates. End quote.

Fath al-Bari (11/292)

And Allah knows best.