

184957 - A fabricated hadeeth about the reward for charity given on behalf of the deceased being presented to him on a platter of light

the question

How sound is this hadeeth: "If you offer supplication for the deceased, the angel will enter upon him with a platter of light and will say: 'This is a gift to you from your brother or relative So and and so,' and he will rejoice thereat"?

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

This hadeeth is fabricated. It was narrated by at-Tabaraani in al-Mu'jam al-Awsat (6504): Muhammad ibn Dawood ibn Aslam as-Sadafi told us, 'Ubaydullah ibn 'Abdillah al-Munkadiri told us, Muhammad ibn Ismaa'eel ibn Abi Fudayk said: I heard Abu Muhammad ash-Shaami narrate that he heard Abu Hurayrah say that he heard Anas ibn Maalik say: I heard the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) say: "There is no household of whom one person dies and they give charity on his behalf after his death, but Jibreel (peace be upon him) will present it to him on a platter of light. He will stand at the edge of the grave and say: 'O occupant of the deep grave, this is a gift given to you by your family, so accept it.' Then he will enter upon him, and he will rejoice thereat and be of good cheer, and his neighbours who were not given anything will be sad."

At-Tabaraani said after quoting it: This hadeeth was not narrated from Anas except via this isnaad, which was narrated only by Ibn Abi Fudayk.

Al-Haythami (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

It was narrated by at-Tabaraani in al-Awsat; its isnaad includes Abu Muhammad ash-Shaami, of whom al-Azdi said: He is a liar.

End quote from Majma' az-Zawaa'id, 3/139

Shaykh al-Albaani (may Allah have mercy on him) mentioned it in as-Silsilah ad-Da'eefah (486) and said: It is fabricated ... The problem with this hadeeth is that it is narrated by Abu Muhammad ash-Shaami. Adh-Dhahabi said: He narrated odd hadeeths from some of the Taabi'een. Al-Azdi said: He is a liar.

This is how it appears in al-Lisaan; it is as if what they meant by munkar hadeeth was this report. End quote.

So it is not permissible to attribute these words to the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) or to narrate it from him except for the purpose of explaining its status and to warn against narrating it, because the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: "Whoever narrates a hadeeth from me thinking that it is a lie is one of the liars." Narrated by Muslim in the Introduction to his Saheeh (1/7).

An-Nawawi (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

This hadeeth contains a stern warning against lying and indicates that whoever thinks it most likely that what he is narrating is false but still narrates it is a liar. How can he not be a liar when he is telling you of something that did not happen? End quote.

In the same chapter there is another hadeeth which says: "The dead person in his grave is like the drowning person who calls for help, hoping for a supplication to reach him from his father or mother or brother or friend, and when it reaches him it will be dearer to him than this world and everything in it. Allah will cause to reach the inhabitants of the graves gifts like mountains as a result of the supplication of the inhabitant of houses (i.e., the living). And the gift of the living to

Islam Question & Answer

General Supervisor:
Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid

the dead is prayers for forgiveness.”

This was quoted by Shaykh al-Albaani in as-Silsilah ad-Da'eefah (799). He said: (It is) munkar jiddan (very odd). End quote.

With regard to the hadeeth which says: “When you offer supplication for the dead, the angel enters upon him with a platter of light...”, we could not find any such report from the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) whether this version or the first version. So it is not permissible to attribute that to the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) just as it is not permissible to quote it, even if it is not attributed to the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him), because the matter of al-barzakh is one of the matters of the unseen, and it is not permissible to indulge in talking about it without knowledge.

And Allah knows best.