

212378 - A specious argument regarding the view that it is prohibited for women to visit graves, and the refutation thereof

the question

Is hadith no. 1392 in the *Mustadrak* of al-Hakim, which speaks about women visiting graves, an authentic or weak hadith?

Detailed answer

Firstly:

There is a difference of scholarly opinion about women visiting graveyards, and there are three views. The first is that it is prohibited, the second is that it is disliked but not prohibited, and the third is that it is permissible for them and is not disliked.

Ibn al-Qayyim: *Tahdhib as-Sunan*, 2/106-107.

On our website we favour the view that it is prohibited. See the answers to questions no. [8198](#) and [34464](#).

Secondly:

Those who say that it is permissible quoted as evidence the hadith narrated by al-Hakim (1392) via al-Bayhaqi (7207) from `Abdullah ibn Abi Mulaykah, which says that `A'ishah was on her way back from the graveyard one day, and I said to her: O Mother of the Believers, where are you coming from? She said: From the grave of my brother `Abd ar-Rahman ibn Abi Bakr. I said to her: Didn't the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) forbidden visiting graves? She said: Yes, he had forbidden it, then he enjoined people to visit them.

This isnad of the hadith is sound, and its narrators are all trustworthy. Al-Hafiz al-'Iraqi said:

It was narrated by Ibn Abi'd-Dunya regarding graves with a good isnad.

Takhrij Ahadith al-Ihya', p. 1872.

It was classed as authentic by al-Albani in *Al-Irwa'*, 3/233.

It was also narrated in brief by Ibn Majah. His version says: It was narrated from 'A'ishah that the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) allowed visiting graves.

It was classed as authentic by al-Busayri in *Az-Zawa'id*, 2/42.

At-Tirmidhi (1055) narrated it from 'Abdullah ibn Abi Mulaykah. His version is: He said: 'Abd ar-Rahman ibn Abi Bakr died in Hubshi, then he was carried to Makkah and was buried there. When 'A'ishah travelled to Makkah, she went to the grave of 'Abd ar-Rahman ibn Abi Bakr.

She said: By Allah, if I had been there [when you died], you would not have been buried except in the place where you died, and if I had been there when you died, I would not have visited your grave.

Al-Albani classed this hadith as weak in *Da'if at-Tirmidhi*.

Those who disallow women to visit graves refuting this report by noting several points:

- She did not set out for the purpose of visiting the grave; rather she set out for Hajj and passed by his grave, so she stopped there to offer supplication for him.
- Even if we assume that she intended to visit the grave, that was her individual understanding and it does not contradict the proven reports which say that it is prohibited for women to visit graves.
- Her words "he had forbidden it, then he enjoined people to visit them [graves]" are a general statement, which does not contradict the specific ruling on women visiting graves. Rather it is like the Prophet's words "I used to forbid you to visit graves, but now visit them." Narrated by Muslim, 977. Ibn al-Qayyim (may Allah have mercy on him) said: ... 'A'ishah only came to Makkah for Hajj, but she passed by her brother's grave on the way, so she stopped there, and there is nothing wrong with that. Rather the issue is if women set out for the purpose of visiting graves. But even if we assume that she changed her route and deliberately aimed to visit the grave, she herself said: "I had been present when you died, I would not have visited your grave." This indicates that she was well aware that it is

not prescribed for women to visit graves, otherwise her saying this would not mean anything. Regarding the report of al-Bayhaqi, which narrates that she said: “he had forbidden it, then he enjoined people to visit them [graves]”, even if it is authentic, that is her understanding, just as others understood it as including women. But what matters is what the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said, not the interpretation of the narrator, which may be accepted when there is no stronger evidence that contradicts it, but in this case it is contradicted by the hadiths which speak of the prohibition on women visiting graves. (*Tahdhib as-Sunan*, 2/110-111).

See also: *Majmu` Fatawa wa Rasa`il al-`Uthaymin*, 9/430; *Fatawa al-Lajnah ad-Da`imah*, 9/103.

And Allah knows best.