197919 - Dhu’l-Khuwaysirah at-Tameemi was a hypocrite

the question

There is a narration that says that Abdullah ibn Dhil Khawaisara At Tamimi said to the Messenger Be just.
Did Abdullah become an apostate by saying this or a munafiq. Can you quote scholars who commented on this narration.

Detailed answer

Praise be to Allah.

Al-Bukhaari (3610) and Muslim (1064) narrated that Abu Sa‘eed al-Khudri (may Allah have mercy on him) said: whilst we were with the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) and he was sharing out some wealth, Dhu’l-Khuwaysirah, a man from Banu Tameem, came and said: O Messenger of Allah, be fair! The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “Woe to you! Who will be fair if I am not fair? You will be doomed and lost if I am not fair.” ‘Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) said: O Messenger of Allah, give me permission to strike his neck. The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “Let him be, for he has companions, in comparison to whose prayer one of you would regard his prayer as insignificant, and he would regard his fasting as insignificant in comparison to their fasting. They recite the Qur’aan but it does not go any further than their collarbones. They will pass out of Islam as an arrow passes out of the prey. whilst we were with the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) and he was sharing out some wealth, Dhu’l-Khuwaysirah, a man from Banu Tameem, came and said: O Messenger of Allah, be fair! The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “Woe to you! Who will be fair if I am not fair? You will be doomed and lost if I am not fair.” ‘Umar ibn al-Khattaab (may Allah be pleased with him) said: O Messenger of Allah, give me permission to strike his neck. The Messenger of Allah (blessings and

peace of Allah be upon him) said: “Let him be, for he has companions, in comparison to whose prayer one of you would regard his prayer as insignificant, and he would regard his fasting as insignificant in comparison to their fasting. They recite the Qur’aan but it does not go any further than their collarbones. They will pass out of Islam as an arrow passes out of the prey

This Dhu’l-Khuwaysirah was the leader of the Khawaarij. See the answer to question no. 191140

According to another report narrated by Abu Sa‘eed: ‘Ali ibn Abi Taalib sent to the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) some gold from Yemen in a tanned leather bag, that had not been purified of the earth clinging to it. He shared it out among four men: ‘Uyaynah ibn Badr, al-Aqra’ ibn Haabis, Zayd al-Khayl and the fourth, who was either ‘Alqamah ibn ‘Ulaathah or ‘Aamir ibn al-Tufayl. One of his companions said: We had more right to it than these men. News of that reached the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) and he said: “Do you not trust me, when I am the trustee of the One Who is above the heaven and the news of heaven comes to me morning and evening?” A man with sunken eyes, prominent cheeks, a high forehead, a thick beard and shaven head stood up, tucking up his izaar, and said: O Messenger of Allah, fear Allah! He said: “Woe to you! Am I not the one who should fear Allah the most among the people of earth?” Then the man turned and left, and Khaalid ibn al-Waleed said: O Messenger of Allah, should I not strike his neck (kill him)? He said: “No, perhaps he prays.” Khaalid said: How many of those who pray say with their tongues what is not in their hearts? The Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “I have not been commanded to check people’s hearts or split open their bellies (meaning checking what is in their hidden thoughts).” Then he looked at him as he was going back and said: “From among the progeny of this man will emerge people who recite the Book of Allah fluently, but it will not go any further than their throats. They will pass out of the faith as an arrow passes out of the prey.”

Al-Haafiz Ibn Hajar (may Allah have mercy on him) said: This man was Dhu’l-Khuwaysirah at-Tameemi. End quote.

This man was a hypocrite.

Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

The Qur'an stated that this man was a hypocrite: "And of them are some who accuse you (O Muhammad blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) in the matter of (the distribution of) the alms" [at-Tawbah 9:58], i.e., he will criticise and cast aspersions upon you. By telling the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) to be just and fear Allah, after he had given that wealth only to those four people, he was accusing the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) of being unjust and not fearing Allah. Hence the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: "Am I not the one who should fear Allah the most among the people of earth? Do you not trust me, when I am the trustee of the One Who is above the heaven?"

Such words would undoubtedly deserve execution, if anyone were to say them today. The Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) only refrained from executing him because he outwardly appeared to be a Muslim, by regularly praying, which is what people are to be fought for until they do it. His hypocrisy was because of what he caused the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) of offence, but the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) had the right to pardon him and overlook his misdeed. He used to pardon them and overlook their misdeeds in order to soften their hearts towards Islam, lest the people said that Muhammad was killing his companions.

End quote from as-Saarim al-Maslool (pp. 228-229)

This is also indicated by the report narrated by Muslim (1063) from Jaabir ibn 'Abdullah (may Allah be pleased with him) who said: A man came to the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) in al-Ji'raanah, when he was on his way back from Hunayn. In the cloak of Bilaal there was some silver and the Messenger of Allah (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) was giving handfuls of it to the people. He said: O Muhammad, be fair! He said: "Woe to you! Who will be fair if I am not fair? I will be doomed and lost if I am not fair." 'Umar ibn al-Khattaab (may Allah be pleased with him) said: "O Messenger of Allah, let me kill this hypocrite! He said: "Allah forbid that the people should say that I kill my companions. This man and his ilk read the Qur'an, but it does not go any further than their throats, and they pass through it like an arrow passing through

the prey.”

The Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) did not rebuke ‘Umar (may Allah be pleased with him) for calling him a hypocrite.

It is also indicated by the report narrated by al-Bukhaari from the hadeeth of Abu Sa‘eed mentioned above (6933), in which Abu Sa‘eed said: I bear witness that I heard it from the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him), and I bear witness that ‘Ali killed them, and I was with him. A man was brought who matched the description given by the Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him). He said: And these words were revealed concerning him (interpretation of the meaning): “And of them are some who accuse you (O Muhammad blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) in the matter of (the distribution of) the alms” [at-Tawbah 9:58].

The words of Allah, “And of them are some who accuse you (O Muhammad blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) in the matter of (the distribution of) the alms” [at-Tawbah 9:58], were revealed concerning the hypocrites.

Ibn Katheer (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

Allah, may He be exalted, says ‘And of them’ that is, among the hypocrites ‘are some who accuse you’ that is, they criticize you with regard to the distribution of the alms or charity, when you share it out, and they make accusations against you. They are the ones who deserve to be accused, yet despite that their objection is not motivated by religious concerns; rather it is motivated by their whims and desires. Hence if they are given something they are pleased, but if they are not given something, they become enraged, i.e., they get angry.

End quote from Tafseer Ibn Katheer (4/144)

Al-Qaari (may Allah have mercy on him) said:

Dhu’l-Khuwaysirah was a man from Banu Tameem concerning whom the words of Allah, may He be exalted, were revealed (interpretation of the meaning): “And of them are some who accuse you (O Muhammad blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) in the matter of (the distribution of) the

alms” [at-Tawbah 9:58]. Hence he was one of the hypocrites.

End quote from Mirqaat al-Mafaateeh (9/3799)

See also:

‘Umdat al-Qaari (16/143)

Daleel al-Faaliheen (1/186)

Tafseer Ibn ‘Atiyyah (3/46)

Sharh az-Zarqaani ‘ala al-Muwatta’ (1/251)

At-Tahdheer wa’t-Tanweer (10/232)

See the answer to question no. 148986 for information on the difference between the hypocrite and the apostate

And Allah knows best.